UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/540,597	01/18/2006	Declan Patrick Kelly	CN 020040	9072

24737   7590   05/28/2010
PHILIPS INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY & STANDARDS
P.O. BOX 3001
BRIARCLIFF MANOR, NY 10510

EXAMINER
CHOKSHI, PINKAL R

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
2425	

MAIL DATE	DELIVERY MODE
05/28/2010	PAPER

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES

Application Number: 10/540,597
Filing Date: January 18, 2006
Appellant(s): KELLY ET AL.

_____

Thomas J. Onka
<u>For Appellant</u>

EXAMINER'S ANSWER

This is in response to the appeal brief filed April 5, 2010 appealing from the

Office action mailed July 21, 2009.

(1) Real Party in Interest

The examiner has no comment on the statement, or lack of statement, identifying by name the real party in interest in the brief.

(2) Related Appeals and Interferences

The examiner is not aware of any related appeals, interferences, or judicial proceedings which will directly affect or be directly affected by or have a bearing on the Board's decision in the pending appeal.

(3) Status of Claims

The following is a list of claims that are rejected and pending in the application: Claims 1, 2, 6-10, and 13-22.

(4) Status of Amendments After Final

The examiner has no comment on the appellant's statement of the status of amendments after final rejection contained in the brief.

(5) Summary of Claimed Subject Matter

The examiner has no comment on the summary of claimed subject matter contained in the brief.

(6) Grounds of Rejection to be Reviewed on Appeal

The examiner has no comment on the appellant's statement of the grounds of rejection to be reviewed on appeal. Every ground of rejection set forth in the Office action from which the appeal is taken (as modified by any advisory actions) is being maintained by the examiner except for the grounds of rejection (if any) listed under the

subheading "WITHDRAWN REJECTIONS." New grounds of rejection (if any) are

provided under the subheading "NEW GROUNDS OF REJECTION."

(7) Claims Appendix

The examiner has no comment on the copy of the appealed claims contained in

the Appendix to the appellant's brief.

(8) Evidence Relied Upon

6,556,546	Maeda	4-2003
6,886,178	Mao	4-2005
2003/0193520	Oetzel	10-2003
7,043,484	Rotem	5-2006
6,504,996	Na	1-2003

(9) Grounds of Rejection

The following ground(s) of rejection are applicable to the appealed claims:

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

1.   The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all

obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

> (a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.

2.   **Claims 1, 2, 8-10, 15-18, and 20-22** are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as

being unpatentable over US Patent 6,556,546 B1 to Maeda et al (hereafter referenced

as Maeda) in view of US Patent 6,886,178 B1 to Mao et al (hereafter referenced as

Mao) and US PG Pub 2003/0193520 to Oetzel (hereafter referenced as Oetzel).

Regarding **claim 1,** "a digital broadcast method for supporting DVD

recording" reads on the method for transmission and reception of audio/video

data stream which is recorded on DVD media (abstract) disclosed by Maeda and

represented in Fig. 1.

As to "a method comprising: providing a video elementary stream, an

audio elementary stream and a navigation data stream of at least one of DVD

programs" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 42-50) that it presents audio/video data

of DVD along with procedure and selection information data for playing back

audio/video data.

As to "packing said video elementary stream, said audio elementary

stream and said navigation data stream into a transport stream" Maeda discloses

(col.2, lines 42-50) that the audio/video data and procedure information data are

multiplexed into a packet and transmitted to a recording media.

As to "wherein said navigation data stream includes at least one of, in-

stream data and out-stream data, data for searching, data for reproduction

control, and data for generating menus" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 40-50) that

the transmitting device transmits digital audio/video data along with management

information data (navigation data) for playing back digital audio/video data as

represented in Fig. 1 (elements 1, 2). Maeda further discloses (abstract) that the

management information is used in playback device so the playback device can

make use of various playback functions, such as playback of audio/video, a change of playback procedure (forward/rewind/pause) and a selection of playback information (menu).

Maeda meets all the limitations of the claim except "broadcasting said transport stream" Mao discloses (col.6, lines 15-25) that the head-end broadcasts MPEG-2 transport stream to set-top box as represented in Figs. 1 and 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of the ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to modify Maeda's system by using transport stream as taught by Mao in order to reproduce DVD quality data at the receiving device using MPEG-2 stream included in transport stream (col.1, lines 26-27).

Combination of Maeda and Mao meets all the limitations of the claim except "wherein the navigation data also includes data for reproduction control." However, Oetzel discloses (¶0006, ¶0016 and claim 27) that the DVD program material transmitted from the server workstation includes audio/video data and control data that defines the way the content is organized and the way in which user input will affect the navigational flow through the audio/video data as represented in Fig. 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of the ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to modify Maeda and Mao's systems by including control data in the navigational data as taught by Oetzel in order to easily communicate with the playback device by inputting or altering according to the choices or navigation of the user (¶0005).

Regarding **claim 2,** Maeda meets all the limitations of the claim except

"the method wherein, said packing is carried out according to a digital broadcast

standard, and said navigation data stream is loaded into the transport stream as

a private stream of the digital broadcast standard." However, Mao discloses

(col.6, lines 60-64) that the head-end inserts navigation data using industry

standard of the MPEG-2 protocol. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one

of ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to use broadcast/MPEG

standard to transmit streams as taught by Mao in order to reproduce standard

DVD information with ease.

Regarding **claim 8,** "a method for receiving and recording DVD digital

broadcast" reads on the method for transmission and reception of audio/video

data stream which is recorded on DVD media (abstract) disclosed by Maeda and

represented in Fig. 1.

As to "a method comprising: acquiring a video elementary stream, an

audio elementary stream and a navigation data stream of at least one of DVD

programs from the transport stream" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 42-46) that it

presents audio/video data along with procedure and selection information data

for playing back audio/video data.

As to "synthesizing said video elementary stream, audio elementary

stream and navigation data stream into a DVD program stream" Maeda discloses

(col.2, lines 42-50) that the audio/video data and procedure information data are multiplexed into a packet and transmitted to a recording media.

As to "wherein the navigation data includes at least one of, in-stream data and out-stream data, data for searching, data for reproduction control, and data for generating menus" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 40-50) that the transmitting device transmits digital audio/video data along with management information data (navigation data) for playing back digital audio/video data as represented in Fig. 1 (elements 1, 2). Maeda further discloses (abstract) that the management information is used in playback device so the playback device can make use of various playback functions, such as playback of audio/video, a change of playback procedure (forward/rewind/pause) and a selection of playback information (menu).

As to "recording the DVD program stream onto a user's recording medium in a DVD format" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 8-13) that the MPEG2 digital video data, audio data and procedure information that met the DVD standard, are recorded in the device.

Maeda meets all the limitations of the claim except "acquiring transport stream" Mao discloses (col.6, lines 15-25) that the head-end broadcasts MPEG-2 transport stream to set-top box as represented in Figs. 1 and 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of the ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to modify Maeda's system by using transport stream as taught by Mao

in order to reproduce DVD quality data at the receiving device using MPEG-2

stream included in transport stream (col.1, lines 26-27).

Combination of Maeda and Mao meets all the limitations of the claim

except "wherein the navigation data also includes data for reproduction control."

However, Oetzel discloses (¶0006, ¶0016 and claim 27) that the DVD program

material transmitted from the server workstation includes audio/video data and

control data, which defines the way the content is organized and the way in

which user input will affect the navigational flow through the audio/video data as

represented in Fig. 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of the

ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to modify Maeda and Mao's

systems by including control data in the navigational data as taught by Oetzel in

order to easily communicate with the playback device by inputting or altering

according to the choices or navigation of the user (¶0005).

Regarding **claim 9,** Maeda meets all the limitations of the claim except

"the method, wherein the transport stream complies with a digital broadcast

standard, the navigation data stream is loaded into the transport stream as a

private data stream of the digital broadcast standard." However, Mao discloses

(col.6, lines 60-64) that the head-end inserts navigation data using industry

standard of the MPEG-2 protocol. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one

of ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to use broadcast/MPEG

standard to transmit streams as taught by Mao in order to reproduce standard

DVD information with ease.

Regarding **claim 10,** "the method wherein synthesizing includes:

separating the navigation data into the in-stream data and the out-stream data"

Maeda discloses (col.3, lines 4-6) that the audio/video data and management

information are separated from the received packet stream.

As to "synthesizing the in-stream data, the video elementary stream and

the audio elementary stream into the DVD program stream and caching the out-

stream data" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 42-50) that the audio/video data are

multiplexed into a packet along with procedure information which is stored on the

recording medium. Maeda further discloses (col.12, lines 11-16) that the device

stored playback management information issued from the data separating

device.

As to "said recording includes: recording the out-stream data onto said

recording medium" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 8-13) that the procedure

information is being recorded along with MPEG2 audio/video data on the

recording device.

Regarding **claim 15,** "a digital broadcast system for supporting user DVD

recording" reads on the method for transmission and reception of audio/video

data stream which is recorded on DVD media (abstract) disclosed by Maeda and represented in Fig. 1.

As to "a system comprising: program source means, for generating a video elementary stream, an audio elementary stream and a navigation data stream of at least one of DVD programs" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 8-13, 42-46) that the system presents MPEG2 audio/video data with procedure and selection information data for playing back audio/video data.

As to "wherein the navigation data includes at least one of, in-stream data and out-stream data, data for searching, data for reproduction control, and data for generating menus" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 40-50) that the transmitting device transmits digital audio/video data along with management information data (navigation data) for playing back digital audio/video data as represented in Fig. 1 (elements 1, 2). Maeda further discloses (abstract) that the management information is used in playback device so the playback device can make use of various playback functions, such as playback of audio/video, a change of playback procedure (forward/rewind/pause) and a selection of playback information (menu).

As to "digital front end means, packing said video elementary stream, said audio elementary stream and said navigation data stream from said program source means into a transport stream" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 42-50) that the audio/video data and procedure information data are multiplexed into a packet and transmitted to a recording media.

Maeda meets all the limitations of the claim except "outputting the transport stream to a broadcast network for broadcasting" Mao discloses (col.6, lines 15-25) that the head-end broadcasts MPEG-2 transport stream to set-top box as represented in Figs. 1 and 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of the ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to modify Maeda's system by using transport stream as taught by Mao in order to reproduce DVD quality data at the receiving device using MPEG-2 stream included in transport stream (col.1, lines 26-27).

Combination of Maeda and Mao meets all the limitations of the claim except "wherein the navigation data also includes data for reproduction control." However, Oetzel discloses (¶0006, ¶0016 and claim 27) that the DVD program material transmitted from the server workstation includes audio/video data and control data, which defines the way the content is organized and the way in which user input will affect the navigational flow through the audio/video data as represented in Fig. 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of the ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to modify Maeda and Mao's systems by including control data in the navigational data as taught by Oetzel in order to easily communicate with the playback device by inputting or altering according to the choices or navigation of the user (¶0005).

Regarding **claim 16,** Maeda meets all the limitations of the claim except "the system, wherein said digital front end means packs said video elementary

stream, said audio elementary stream and said navigation data stream into said

transport stream according to a digital broadcast standard, wherein said

navigation data stream is loaded into said transport stream as a private stream of

the digital broadcast standard." However, Mao discloses (col.6, lines 60-64) that

the head-end inserts navigation data using industry standard of the MPEG-2

protocol. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skills in the

art at the time of the invention to use broadcast/MPEG standard to transmit

streams as taught by Mao in order to reproduce standard DVD information with

ease.

Regarding **claim 17,** "the system, further including a plurality of receiving

means, wherein at least one of them has a DVD recording function" Maeda

discloses (col.2, lines 46-50) that the audio/video data received are recorded in

DVD recording medium.

Regarding **claim 18,** "a device for receiving and recording DVD digital

broadcast" reads on the method for transmission and reception of audio/video

data stream which is recorded on DVD media (abstract) disclosed by Maeda and

represented in Fig. 1.

As to "comprising: acquiring means, acquiring a video elementary stream,

an audio elementary stream and a navigation data stream of at least one of DVD

programs from said transport stream" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 42-46) that it

presents audio/video data along with procedure and selection information data for playing back audio/video data.

As to "wherein the navigation data includes at least one of, in-stream data and out-stream data, data for searching, data for reproduction control, and data for generating menus" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 40-50) that the transmitting device transmits digital audio/video data along with management information data (navigation data) for playing back digital audio/video data as represented in Fig. 1 (elements 1, 2). Maeda further discloses (abstract) that the management information is used in playback device so the playback device can make use of various playback functions, such as playback of audio/video, a change of playback procedure (forward/rewind/pause) and a selection of playback information (menu).

As to "synthesizing means, synthesizing said video elementary stream, said audio elementary stream and said navigation data stream into a DVD program stream" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 42-50) that the audio/video data and procedure information data are multiplexed into a packet and transmitted to a recording media.

As to "DVD producing and recording means, recording the DVD program stream onto a user's recording medium in a DVD format" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 8-13) that the MPEG2 digital video data, audio data and procedure information that met the DVD standard, are recorded in the device.

Maeda meets all the limitations of the claim except "receiving means,

receiving a broadcast transport stream." However, Mao discloses (col.6, lines

15-25) that the head-end broadcasts MPEG-2 transport stream to set-top box as

represented in Figs. 1 and 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of

the ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to modify Maeda's system

by using transport stream as taught by Mao in order to reproduce DVD quality

data at the receiving device using MPEG-2 stream included in transport stream

(col.1, lines 26-27).

Combination of Maeda and Mao meets all the limitations of the claim

except "wherein the navigation data also includes data for reproduction control."

However, Oetzel discloses (¶0006, ¶0016 and claim 27) that the DVD program

material transmitted from the server workstation includes audio/video data and

control data, which defines the way the content is organized and the way in

which user input will affect the navigational flow through the audio/video data as

represented in Fig. 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of the

ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to modify Maeda and Mao's

systems by including control data in the navigational data as taught by Oetzel in

order to easily communicate with the playback device by inputting or altering

according to the choices or navigation of the user (¶0005).

Regarding **claim 20,** "the device wherein the device further includes:

separating means, receiving the navigation data stream generated by the

navigation data decoder, separating the navigation data stream into the in-stream data and out-stream data and outputting the in-stream data to the synthesizing means and outputting the out-stream data to a buffer" Maeda discloses (col.3, lines 4-6) that the audio/video data and management information are separated from the received packet stream. Maeda further discloses (col.12, lines 11-16) that the device stored playback management information issued from the data separating device.

As to "synthesizing the in-stream data from the separating means, video elementary stream from the video decoder and the audio elementary stream from the audio decoder into the DVD program stream by the synthesizing means" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 42-50) that the audio/video data are multiplexed into a packet.

As to "recording the synthesized DVD program stream and said out-stream data onto the recording medium in the DVD format by the DVD producing and recording means" Maeda discloses (col.2, lines 8-13) that the MPEG2 digital video data, audio data and procedure information that met the DVD standard, are recorded in the device.

Regarding **claim 21,** "the method wherein the navigation data includes hyperlink data to enable users to visit related websites or obtain viewing authorization information" Mao discloses (abstract) that the MPEG-2 data transmitted to receiver includes audio/video data as well as Internet HTML web

page data multiplexed within the MPEG-2 stream. Mao further discloses (col.3,

lines 20-37 and col.8, lines 30-32) that the head-end server broadcasts MPEG-2

stream that also includes web page information, which is related to the contents

of the broadcast video program viewer's watching. Therefore, it would have been

obvious to one of the ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to

modify Maeda's system by using web-page data to visit related websites and

transmit data using transport stream as taught by Mao in order for the user to

switch back and forth between Internet content and broadcast content and to

reproduce DVD quality data at the receiving device using MPEG-2 stream

included in transport stream (col.1, lines 26-27).

Regarding **claim 22,** "the method wherein the navigation data includes

hyperlink data to enable users to visit related websites or obtain viewing

authorization information" Mao discloses (abstract) that the MPEG-2 data

transmitted to receiver includes audio/video data as well as Internet HTML web

page data multiplexed within the MPEG-2 stream. Mao further discloses (col.3,

lines 20-37 and col.8, lines 30-32) that the head-end server broadcasts MPEG-2

stream that also includes web page information, which is related to the contents

of the broadcast video program viewer's watching. Therefore, it would have been

obvious to one of the ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to

modify Maeda's system by using web-page data to visit related websites and

transmit data using transport stream as taught by Mao in order for the user to

switch back and forth between Internet content and broadcast content and to

reproduce DVD quality data at the receiving device using MPEG-2 stream

included in transport stream (col.1, lines 26-27).

3.   **Claims 6, 7, 13 and 14** are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being

unpatentable over Maeda in view of Mao and Oetzel as applied to claims 1 and 8

above, and further in view of US Patent 7,043,484 B2 to Rotem et al (hereafter

referenced as Rotem).

Regarding **claim 6,** combination of Maeda, Mao and Oetzel meets all the

limitations of the claim except "the method wherein said in-stream data includes

data for connecting networks." However, Rotem discloses (col.7, line 59-col.8,

line 5) that the media server receives DVD images and titles from a plurality of

media sources as represented in Fig. 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious

to one of ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to connect server

with multiple media sources/networks as taught by Rotem in order to have more

selection of DVD title records (col.3, lines 52-53).

Regarding **claim 7,** combination of Maeda, Mao and Oetzel meets all the

limitations of the claim except "the method wherein the in-stream data includes

video and/or audio data selected by a broadcaster." However, Rotem discloses

(col.8, lines 6-10) that based on the request received; server selects and

produces an audio/video DVD image from database. Therefore, it would have

been obvious to one of ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to

connect server with multiple media sources/networks as taught by Rotem in

order to have more selection of DVD title records (col.3, lines 52-53).

Regarding **claim 13,** combination of Maeda, Mao and Oetzel meets all the

limitations of the claim except "the method wherein said in-stream data includes

data for connecting networks." However, Rotem discloses (col.7, line 59-col.8,

line 5) that the media server receives DVD images and titles from a plurality of

media sources as represented in Fig. 2. Therefore, it would have been obvious

to one of ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to connect server

with multiple media sources/networks as taught by Rotem in order to have more

selection of DVD title records (col.3, lines 52-53).

Regarding **claim 14,** combination of Maeda, Mao and Oetzel meets all the

limitations of the claim except "the method wherein said in-stream data includes

video and/or audio data selected by a broadcaster." However, Rotem discloses

(col.8, lines 6-10) that based on the request received; server selects and

produces a audio/video DVD image from database. Therefore, it would have

been obvious to one of ordinary skills in the art at the time of the invention to

connect server with multiple media sources/networks as taught by Rotem in

order to have more selection of DVD title records (col.3, lines 52-53).

4.   **Claim 19** is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Maeda

in view of Mao and Oetzel as applied to claim18 above, and further in view of US Patent

6,504,996 to Na (hereafter referenced as Na).

Regarding **claim 19,** Maeda meets all the limitations of the claim except

""the device, wherein said transport stream complies with an existing digital

broadcast standard, the navigation data stream is loaded into said transport

stream as a private data stream of the digital broadcast standard" Mao discloses

(col.6, lines 60-64) that the head-end inserts navigation data using industry

standard of the MPEG-2 protocol.

As to "acquiring means includes: a demultiplexer, for demultiplexing said

transport stream and acquiring video data, audio data and navigation data of a

program" Mao discloses (col.8, lines 37-45) that the receiver includes MPEG-2

demultiplexer that demultiplexes MPEG-2 stream into audio, video, and

navigation stream as represented in Fig. 8 (element 808).

As to "video decoder, for decoding said video data and generating the

video elementary stream" Mao discloses (col.8, lines 42-45) that the MPEG-2

demultiplexer provides audio/video stream to MPEG-2 decoder as represented in

Fig. 8 (element 810).

As to "audio decoder, for decoding said audio data and generating the

audio elementary stream" Mao discloses (col.8, lines 42-45) that the MPEG-2

demultiplexer provides audio/video stream to MPEG-2 decoder as represented in

Fig. 8 (element 810). Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of ordinary

skills in the art at the time of the invention to demux audio/video stream as taught

by Mao in order to divide streams and retrieve original streams.

Combination of Maeda, Mao and Oetzel meets all the limitations of the

claim except "navigation data decoder, for decoding the navigation data and

generating the navigation data stream." However, Na discloses (col.8, lines 40-

43) that the navigation decoder decodes the navigation stream and provides a

command to the video mixer as represented in Fig. 5 (element 450). Therefore,

it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skills in the art at the time of the

invention to use navigation decoders to decode navigation data stream as taught

by Na in order to split streams and retrieve original streams.

(10) Response to Argument

With regard to the appellant's ARGUMENT section beginning on pg. 6 of the

Appeal Brief, the appellant has provided arguments addressing the 35 USC 103(a)

rejections of claims 1, 2, 8-10, 15-18, and 20-22 under Maeda (US 6,556,546) in view of

Mao (US 6,886,178) and further in view of Oetzel (US 2003/0193520), and claims 6, 7,

13 and 14 under 35 USC 103(a) over Maeda in view of Mao and Oetzel and further in

view of Rotem (US 7,043,484), and claim 19 under 35 USC 103(a) over Maeda in view

of Mao and Oetzel and further in view of Na (US 6,504,996).

Appellant's arguments against the cited art begin on pg. 8 of the brief and are

addresses as follows:

(A) – Rejection of claims 1, 8, 15, and 18 under 35 USC 103

- Appellant states Maeda does not disclose "wherein the navigation data

  also includes data for reproduction control…" Examiner agrees. This

  limitation is taught by Oetzel.

- Appellant argues that Maeda, Mao, and Oetzel, alone or in combination,

  fail to disclose above mentioned limitation. Examiner respectfully

  disagrees. Broadest reasonable interpretation of "reproduction control

  data of navigation data" could mean anything from playing, rewinding,

  forwarding video. Although Applicant specification includes examples of

  "reproduction control data" outside of trick play and simple on-off, these

  specific functionalities are not representative of claim language. Claim

  language only requires simple presentation of the content.

- Oetzel is the reference that is used to teach this limitation that appellant incorrectly states and taught in (¶0006). As mentioned on the pg. 4 of the Final Office action dated July 21, 2009, Oetzel discloses (¶0006, ¶0016, claim 27) that the DVD program content transmitted from the server workstation includes audio/video data and control data, where control data defines the way the content is organized and the way in which user input will affect the navigational flow through the audio/video data.

- Maeda is only used to teach limitations "providing and packing of audio/video stream and navigation data of a DVD program, where the navigation data includes data for generating menus." As explained above, the limitation "reproduction control data" is taught by Oetzel.

(B) – Rejection of claims 2, 6-7, 9-10, 13-14, 16-17 and 19-22 under 35 USC 103

- Appellant provide no further arguments over and above those previously presented with respect to deficiencies believed to exist in the references Maeda, Mao, and Oetzel used to reject independent claims 1, 8, 15, and 18. Accordingly, the rejection of claims 2, 6, 7, 9, 10, 13, 14, 16, 17, and 19-22 is considered proper in light of the previously presented arguments.

(11) Related Proceeding(s) Appendix

No decision rendered by a court or the Board is identified by the examiner in the Related Appeals and Interferences section of this examiner's answer.

For the above reasons, it is believed that the rejections should be sustained.

Respectfully submitted,

/Pinkal R. Chokshi/

Examiner, Art Unit 2425

Conferees:

/Brian T. Pendleton/

Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art Unit 2425

/Christopher Kelley/

Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art Unit 2424